Subject: Re: Questions I would like to pose to athiests Posted by fredcow9 on Tue, 08 May 2012 23:32:06 GMT View Forum Message <> Reply to Message

Quote:firstly, when did you think this instruction was rescinded?

after they were established. They did hold to the custom but its officially no longer relevant after Jesus death.

Quote:secondly, interesting you classify worshipping a different religion as a "threat"; given the circumstances, you dont think other religions enticing Gods people was? Quote: previously you called non-belief a "crime" so i suppose i shouldn't be surprised under Gods rules yes, mans no.

Quote:thirdly, haven't you noticed that one of them is a command for completely indiscriminate slaughter?

The one your referring to after this?

Quote: just a few people in the city worship golden calves or whatever, and that's enough to slaughter the entire city's population down to the last child? good grief

When the people saw that Moses was so long in coming down from the mountain, they gathered around Aaron and said, "Come, make us gods[a] who will go before us. As for this fellow Moses who brought us up out of Egypt, we don't know what has happened to him."

Alet alone when moses just leaves for a little bit, they already start going astray, and you dont think enticing peoples would be a threat to Gods startup plan?

3 So all the people took off their earrings and brought them to Aaron. 4 He took what they handed him and made it into an idol cast in the shape of a calf, fashioning it with a tool. Then they said, "These are your gods,[b] Israel, who brought you up out of Egypt."

sounds like more than a handful of people to me

Quote:uh no, i was referring to yahweh's deliberate targeting of children.

Iv always assumed a silent death is not a big deal, this is more damaging to the parents than the children themselves. Besides, its pharaoh who is allowing this to continue.

Quote: think that exchange is very telling as to the difference between us; me going into quite some detail as to serious problems with your religion, and you having no answer to any of it beyond "join my religion or be tortured" over and over again

Why do you always annotate your own arguments specifying yourself as some kind of victor all the time?

Your not even touching my religion yet alone bringing even one serious problem up besides your moral objection to something. As I have said before and III say it again, if you object to gravity, its still there. When your told not to jump off a cliff or else... then dont do it unless your willing to risk the or else...If you dont care then continue and enjoy the life your living and hopefully things work out for you.

Quote:

who? when? what did they say?

I dont know, I dont think Josephus bothered to note it as his testimony was official enough.

Quote:it's not relevant whether a devout Jewish man who seriously believes in the oncoming messiah is convinced that Jesus is the real deal or not? Saul of Tarsus?

Quote:that's much too generous a statement.

Gospels contradiction with details of Jesus, work on it.

Quote:so again, decades after jesus is supposed to have died.

yes, is that supposed to be unreasonable by historys standards of proof?

Quote:uh no, cos all these "secular writings" basically say is "there's a group of people who believed this guy who lived a few decades ago was their messiah".

Its an acknowledgement and an important one.

Quote:even if this wasn't in a time and place where there was basically no such thing as education,

I was led to believe the Romans were some smart people actually. Didnt the whole empire "fall for this ridiculousness"

Quote:where superstition was rampant and where most people already believed in god(s) anyway, this would still not vindicate the gospels.

So if they already have a belief system you dont think there has to be some element of apparent truth for them to switch in a time period facing death for switching to that religion?

Hey convert to Christianity

Nah dude I could get killed for that

^Thats how it would go if it were not real and people in the area hadent, seen or at least through another source heard about Jesus or seen some sort of miracle.

Quote: I'm glad you mention greek mythology, because there's an analogy i can make. have you read the Iliad? if not, quick summary: story of (some of) the Trojan War, the greek city-states send armies to lay siege to Troy and eventually take it thanks to the wooden horse. while most of the action is done by greek and trojan heroes such as achilles, hector, odysseus etc, the greek gods are also involved and sometimes interfere in events. e.g. at one point the god Apollo sends a plague against the greeks because they were rude to a priest.

now, there is a city which seems like a good candidate for Troy. there might have been a war that destroyed it. suppose some evidence cropped up that a plague ravaged the armies besieging the city. i doubt such evidence could be found - this was centuries before jesus - but suppose it was. or suppose one of the besieging warriors was named Achilles.

this, i'm sure you'll agree, would not prove the greek gods were real.

No, but it would prove some weight behind the illiad and its writers testimony. If he wrote specifically about certain descriptions and more of those descriptions are coming up true than false, its likely you can to at least some extent his story. This especially applies to the bible as the field of archaeology has only worked for it and not against it.

Quote:in other words, finding out that one or two details of the Iliad to be vaguely accurate says nothing about the rest of it, especially the supernatural bits.

indeed

Quote:same for the gospels.

Its why theres way more than 1 or 2 bits that are accurate as shown by secular history. Quote:Yes they are in a time when most couldnt read or write which is why its amazing the gospels are not lying when matched with secular writings dont you think? This is still a valid point.

Quote:you're saying you deliberately picked devout jewish people who rejected the idea that jesus

was the messiah thinking this would be the best way to prove your case?

Theres plenty of other devot Jewish people that DID believe. This only adds to the weight of Christ being a real person, now all that is left in the mix are the details about his life.

Quote:i can suggest a few reasons

- the enormous amount of superstition and credulity of the time and place

Still going to have to say that in a time and place where its definitely not the "cool" thing to believe the only ground it could gain would be because there was truth in it. People dont just up and change their whole belief system as a result of some cool preaching words especially facing death.

Quote:- the fact loads of people there already believed in god(s), specifically judaism and the prospect of an imminent messiah

So as a Jew one would examine, did this Christ fulfill his obligations? was he really the one? The fact these people converted so massively would only be expected if the gospels are telling the truth.

Quote:- the fact there was basically no such thing as education

trying to undermine someones choice to a reality based on if they have their masters degree is not really a valid argument at all. If thats the case I could just say poor people are heathens because they dont know any better and are stupid. see how ignorant that really sounds?

Quote:- the coercive nature of the religion itself, i.e. follow me or you will be tortured

Thats not really the point. Its follow me because you love me, not because your scared of torture. anyone following Jesus because they are scared of torture are really falsely being led. It may be a fact of reality but its not the cause. They all threaten you with something bad for not following. Even the U.S government does.

Besides, I thought your reasoning for why people are Christian is because they are brought up that way. which is it?

Quote:

yes, there were obviously people who refused to deny their religion when threatene with death, and the point i was making is there are far more people who won't join this religion when threatened with even worse.

Who is being threatened with death for not believing? Where did the apostles go and do that?

Quote:nice question dodge. please answer it next time.

eh?

[/QUOTE]

Im too lazy to look it up lol, but you did dodge it.

Quote:how do you know that? history...look it up lol

Quote:So far I have proved the gospels can be trusted again, this is a laughable overstatement [/QUOTE] care to finally dispute this at all?

Quote:not the point i was making. everybody dies. being put to death in horrible ways for non-crimes was not uncommon at all at that time and place. i've consistently been opposed to

blasphemy/heresy trials, and unelected religious bullies having power over the rest of us; i don't need to make a special point of each victim.

Didnt seem like "died" "woop de doo" made the same statement. At least be consistent.

Quote: i think i heard that "virgin" was a mistranslation of "young woman" or something like that?

nah its pretty clear it means virgin and his name will be Immanuel

Quote:but suppose it really is "virgin". how do you know mary was a virgin?

Jesus came from mary, we are told she was a virgin, Jesus performed all these miracles so one can trust hes probably someone special. The prophecy stated he was of virgin birth, mary didnt dispute this. Thats how I know.

Quote:

what's special about this?

The lineage tracings being accurate even when predicted many moons ago.

Quote: joseph counts as jesus' father, does he? interesting

I suppose earthly wise yes, he raised him from birth.

Quote: jesus had a throne?

In love a throne will be established from the house of David, Jesus is of Davids lineage came preaching Love and claimed to be the king of Love essentially. I dont see the confusion.

Quote:

sorry, i'm not following this one.

Just more evidencing that Jesus is from the clan of Judah. Specifically Bethlehem

Quote:that's not really a prediction, is it? rachel was waaaaaay before herod. what's the connection?

Just supporting this weeping for children in Bethlehem.

Rachel was buried there according to Gen 35:19

19 And Rachel died, and was buried in the way to Ephrath--the same is Beth-lehem.

Quote:Quote:Hosea 11:1 When Israel was a child, I loved him, and out of Egypt I called my son. Quote:Matthew 2:14-15 [14] So he got up, took the child and his mother during the night and left for Egypt, [15] where he stayed until the death of Herod. And so was fulfilled what the Lord had said through the prophet: "Out of Egypt I called my son."

again, this isn't really a prediction.

It is, Jesus is supposed to be Gods son, its written about in the OT and fulfilled by how it played out when the time came.

Quote: if this is a prediction, and despite its vagueness i'll say it kinda is, isn't it obvious jesus failed to fulfil it?

seemingly vague or not, he is establishing his laws as a servant of God and going around healing all the sick, This should help, its some of the previous verses leading up the that one Quote:9 Going on from that place, he went into their synagogue, 10 and a man with a shriveled hand was there. Looking for a reason to bring charges against Jesus, they asked him, "Is it lawful to heal on the Sabbath?"

11 He said to them, "If any of you has a sheep and it falls into a pit on the Sabbath, will you not

take hold of it and lift it out? 12 How much more valuable is a person than a sheep! Therefore it is lawful to do good on the Sabbath."

13 Then he said to the man, "Stretch out your hand." So he stretched it out and it was completely restored, just as sound as the other. 14 But the Pharisees went out and plotted how they might kill Jesus.

Quote:barely a prediction. how do you know jesus cured anybody? The testimonials.

Quote:stop me if i'm wrong, but it's David who says this? what does it have to do with Jesus? Yes, it parallels the same as Jesus, He had an extreme amount of enemies and he still does to this day.

Quote:Quote:John 7:48-49 "Has any of the rulers or of the Pharisees believed in him? [49] No! But this mob that knows nothing of the law--there is a curse on them." and

showing the rules at the time these as you claim "devout" Jews.

Quote:Quote:John 15:24-25 [24] If I had not done among them what no one else did, they would not be guilty of sin. But now they have seen these miracles, and yet they have hated both me and my Father. [25] But this is to fulfill what is written in their Law: `They hated me without reason.' notice the vagueness?

notice that they are being ignorant of their own law?

The similar theme of hating for no reason is still applied throughout all of those. Thats the whole point.

Quote:again, it's hard to see in what sense this is a prediction? Prediction: Rejected stone will become capstone Fullfill: Jesus has become the capstone

Quote:again, not a prediction.

Right just so happens hundreds of years before his existence that it was known he would be betrayed for 30 pieces of silver. come on bro

Quote:says david. nothing to do with jesus as far as i can tell. and again, not a prediction. for example, three or four verses previously - the same speech - he says he's beset by "bulls of Bashan". if this is a prophecy, jesus failed to fulfil it.

Dont recall davids hand or feet being pierced ever...

Quote:the first one is in the very same speech as the bulls of bashan, which isn't a prophecy and has nothing to do with jesus.

he protects all his bones

Quote:and you should be glad of that, because if you want to claim it's a prophecy, you can only conclude that jesus failed to fulfil it.

The scriptures have timeless relevance. David doesnt even know it to be honest. Quote:the second one contains an interesting turn of phrase. a variation of it crops up quite a lot: "and this happened so that it would be fulfiled that which was spoken by the prophets". very interesting turn of phrase. sounds like "we did it because the scriptures said it would happen", and there's nothing supernatural about that, is there?

I dont think the roman government gives a rats ass about fulfilling scripture.

Quote:but once again, the bit in psalms seems to have nothing to do with a messiah.

Its David writings in psalms about this man who is coming that are relevant. That is all.

[Quote:quote title=Quote:]Psalm 22:18 They divide my garments among them and cast lots for my clothing.

Quote:Matthew 27:35 When they had crucified him, they divided up his clothes by casting lots still in the bulls of bashan speech[/QUOTE]

Who divided KING davids garments and cast his lots for clothing?

Quote:all of this chapter so far is written in the past tense. in what sense, therefore, is it a prediction?

Its written in the tense of fulfillment. (you know what I mean)

Quote: i wonder how long it would take for a man to cut a tomb out of the rock.

ask a mason.

Quote:

again, notice the vagueness?

I have serious doubts your even reading each one at least once let alone analyzing it for more than 30 seconds.

Quote:got any better ones than these? cos these are not impressive. These are sufficient imo.

Quote:

certainly not that you could prove it.

you can do otherwise? the testimony have not been denied yet...

Quote:okay, let's say the stuff in deuteronomy and leviticus etc is only talking to the people of the time, and not instructions for you. scratch those. we've still got hell, haven't we? (which is worse than the instructions in deuteronomy)

sure, and when you provide me some logic for punishment to not exist III be welcome to entertain it.

Quote:it's worse.

I bet!

Quote: jesus repeatedly threatens people with hell if they don't do as he says.

Youd better go out and help the poor, helpless and save people. Be kind to others and treat your neighbor as thyself. Sounds like a pretty fucked up world to me too.

Quote:and if he claimed to be god, then that's much worse than when your local priest makes the same threats.

No priest has any authority to threaten anyone with anything. Only educate someone on what Gods plan is and details about it.

Quote:no, you missed the point. i speculated that you might actually agree that being tortured for not being the right religion is indeed a bad thing,

Why do you refuse to accept following the wrong religion? People have choices...

Quote: but just haven't realised that you think so. i wonder if you've ever really thought about it, i.e. hell.

yes

Quote: think about it now.

Iv pondered it and it doesnt seem outside the norm one would expect if a God exist.

Quote:interesting. so you think people can be horribly tortured for not being the right religion by God, but you think it's "not right" and "fucked up" when the same thing (or rather, a much more lenient thing) is inflicted by humans?

Yes, Humans are not an ultimate judge, and as much as humans would like to think they are all knowing and supreme they arent. So they have no authority to commit such acts.

Quote:Should a person be tortured as a punishment for not being the right religion? no

Quote:i say: no. you say: yes, but only when it's my religion and when my dictator is doing the torturing.

My God sending someone to a torturous place they already know about is not my fault, or his. Its an established way that life goes. You either accept it exists and then decide fuck it, i dont care if I wind up there, decide I dont want to go there, so III give God pitty worship to get by, or some crazy thought, hell becomes an irrelevant factor in your life decisions and your worship God out of pure willingness! Impossible sounding I know!

Quote:what do you mean by "believe"?

acknowledgement to the extent in full. Same as knowing a bullet to the chest will kill you.

Quote: I've definitely said that it would take more than evidence of god and jesus to make me a christian, because there is more than one objection for me. it's not just the fact that i don't think it's true, there's also the fact that i morally object to a lot of it. finding out that the god of the bible really was real would be very bad news as far as i'm concerned. it's a great relief to think there's no hell. finding out that it was true would mean a few friends and family members are being horribly tortured right now. good people, just not the right religion. i don't think it's possible for me to grasp what a crushing blow this would be.

It seems how if even God himself came down and sat next to you, you wouldnt believe lol. You seem more concerned with the moral objections (your own view of morality), than actual proof or tangible facts here.

Quote:haven't you noticed that satan barely appears in the bible at all?

yes I have

Quote:the war in heaven stuff is only in Revelation, which - let's face it - is so ridiculous it probably shouldn't even be in the bible. even christians can't agree on what the fuck it's talking about. Some of its clear, some of its not. I dont see how something one doesnt understand should just be written off as it seems youd rather have information censored.

Quote:satan barely appears in the books besides that;

In life theres not much need to pay attention to satan at all. Hes kind of moot.

Quote: mainly in Job, where he is a dick but only a secondary antagonist, the primary antagonist obviously being God (may as well be satan's boss, apparently... if this is even the same Satan commonly referred to, and there's a strong argument for saying it isn't)

that, and when he tempts jesus in the wilderness, which isn't much of a big deal Yes hes in job.

Quote:no, the villain of the book is very obviously Yahweh.

That evil God telling man to live properly. How fucked up a world his commandments of thou shalt not kill and love they enemy as thyself. fucked up man

Quote:what mischief does satan do? he kills a few people in Job, certainly an awful thing to do, albeit a thing done with Yahweh's permission. compare that to the enormous death toll Yahweh racks up in the bible, either by wiping people out himself or ordering people to do it (arguably worse) and the whole hell business.

Satan tries to falsify things, give false information, get people to worship other things besides God.

Quote:interesting. i hear this a lot when i talk to christians, "those people aren't really christians". sometimes in the same post as claims of how many christians there are.

hm, I dont hear that alot at all. Mainly I hear some story of how "I worship God how I think he should be" ect ect. pretty much setting God in the realm of a fairy tale where your the only one who provides its testimony.

Quote:christians - or perhaps not christians in your view - never tire of telling us so. Of course not, because why would one not want to discuss whats true and whats not? [Quote:quote title=Quote:]"the fool hath said in his heart, there is no God"

this bit of demagoguery is completely discredited by the following verses, where it says that these non-believers are all horribly wicked and none of them have ever done any good thing. that is so obviously untrue that i wonder why christians ever want to draw attention anywhere near it.[/QUOTE]

It just points out the ridiculousness of not even believing in a Gods existence at all. Its comparable to one actually thinking the monkey at the zoo is actually genetically related to you somehow.

Quote:you must realise how stupid you sound at this point, surely?

of course according to yourself.

Quote:Quote:and of course children are the target demographic, because it doesn't work on intelligent adults.

are you saying I cant come up with a list of intelligent people through history that were christian? Quote:moving the goalposts a bit there.

actually no, you explicitly stated: "it doesn't work on intelligent adults"

"are you saying I cant come up with a list of intelligent people through history that were christian" one reading the first quote would reasonably assume the second quote response would be in order.

Quote:you can also come up with a list of intelligent people who believed other fucking retarded stuff like alchemy and the phlogiston (sp?) theory.

You didnt claim that though.

Quote:question is why were they christians? could it be because they were brought up christians, i.e. indoctrinated as kids, because education was fucking awful at the time,

lol hold on, do you think christianity only exists through lineage? is that your position.

Quote:because christianity had all kinds of political power,

Thats why it was illegal to be christian at its begging right?

Quote:because of hell threats, because of how dangerous it was to admit you weren't a christian? Any men killing you because you are not a christian are about as christian as the men who crucified Jesus.

Its no different if you oppose a law of state, dont break the rule. If you do then expect ramifications.

no, fast-forward to now. it's very, very rare for an intelligent person to convert to christianity through logical, civilised debate without coercion. but then, without coercion, christianity wouldn't be christianity.

Quote:no, it's an observation on the abject failure of my debate opponents to prove anything important, or answer any of my moral objections.

Have you ever objectively analyzed yourself of some kind of failure to adhere to points?

Quote:died on a cross wouldn't be unusual. rising from the dead would be (though it wouldn't vindicate his moral teachings, or even prove that he himself had the supernatural power), so what a shame we've had no evidence of that.

So you can at LEAST agree, a man named Jesus of a specific lineage lived in Israel under Roman occupation, died and crucified at the hands of pontais pilot (sorry the spelling), gained many followers in a short period of time and was extensively written about by his closets followers and historians?

disprove the testimony of the gospels. They are why one can conclude what they do about Christ.

Quote:we can skip over the numerous times when the speeches of jesus don't agree with each other, because that's exactly what you would expect from reports written decades after a person died. who was Joseph's father?

sure whatever you wanna skip. Matthew 1:16 And Jacob begot Joseph the husband of Mary, of whom was born Jesus who is called Christ.

Quote:i'm not sure i believe that you intentionally picked people who do more to undermine your case than support it.

How are they undermining in the least? Where are they hurting the gospels?

Quote:i don't know. to pacify rebellious minorities, perhaps? Or maybe, just maybe there was apparent truth.

Quote:sigh... don't be silly

Just saying, doesnt seem like you analyze much instead just have predetermined answers and responses. enough of this though because its irrelevant and time wasting to argue about the person rather the subject itself.

Quote:"the Christians"?

Quote:and indeed, why would i?

It would take away from the uniqueness and probability of this one religion actually being the one thats correct.

Quote:to say your religion can claim something other religions can't is hardly impressive. If its claims are true? I dont see how you dont get that relevance.

Quote:so, like i said, you haven't proven that jesus said any such thing. the gospels say he said it, so what? prove he said it, please... and then your real work will be still ahead of you: prove he was right.

The gospels are a reliable source on what Jesus said. This all comes down to if you can show the gospels can be trusted to show what Jesus said or not?

Quote:what is hell? a place of torture made by jesus's dad (apparently). obey me or that's where you will go as a punishment. this is an awful way to behave. jesus was not a good person if he said what the gospels say he said.

Well Jesus is part of gods plan, and the world killed Gods son so the world will pay for what it had done unless it reconciles itself. Same for every person. your disagreement doesnt seem to extend more beyond "I just dont want to live that way" or "be accountable" for anything

Quote:see above re: jewish men obviously not thinking jesus was the messiah, christians being referred to derisively, nothing supernatural being vindicated

Establishing these facts about Jesus are important, these sources back up the gospels. They dont have the luxury of just dusting Jesus under the rug because he was just around not even a generation ago in this time. So they simply just deny his claims lol. I mean you even have people that legitimately dont think Jesus existed at all these days. Thats not even an argument and these sources show this.

Quote:who said they were? i'm more inclined to think they ("they" is such a vague word, we really should specify who are we talking about) were just plain wrong ok, so when they wrote the gospels they WERE indeed writing what was what they saw and experienced.

Quote:why would a petty little thing like that bother you? Its a form of censorship and displaying of ignorance. Quote:you're ok with people being horribly tortured for not being the right religion. choosing to not worship God. Quote:if that can't bother you, why get worked up about what some guy says?

I dont personally care, but it just shows weak character

yes